# LR3 – Livingstone Road – Concept Plan – Table of Stakeholder Comments

# Community

Topic	Community comments	Council officer response
Parking on Livingstone Road	<ul> <li>Object to the proposed removal of parking on Livingstone Rd</li> <li>Resident parking will become more difficult</li> <li>Family and friends visiting local residents will have more difficulty finding parking</li> <li>Residents have a right to on-street parking</li> <li>Residents expect on-street parking nearby Removal of on-street parking will affect property values</li> <li>Many houses do not have access to off-street parking / Restrictions on off-street parking should be relaxed</li> <li>Most households have more than one car</li> <li>Propose angle parking on Livingstone Rd</li> <li>New developments are increasing demand for parking</li> </ul>	The concept plan has been amended in response to community concerns to significantly reduce proposed parking impacts on Livingstone Road between Marrickville Park and the Bankstown Line rail corridor.  The final concept plan proposes an <b>overall gain of 7 on-street parking spaces</b> , as follows:  Livingstone Road: net gain of 1 space, comprising:  7 spaces removed  8 new spaces provided  Enfield Street: 6 additional spaces by providing angled parking.
	<ul> <li>Parking is not the highest and best use of this public space</li> <li>There is off-street parking available / Residents should use available off-street parking more</li> <li>New developments have off-street parking</li> </ul>	Community concerns about availability of parking have been noted. The concept plan aims to improve the local bicycle network whilst minimising impacts to parking.
	A bike path will make it more difficult to enter/exit driveways	Motorists entering/exiting driveways are required to give way to bike riders when crossing the bike path just as they are required to give way to pedestrians when crossing the footpath and to vehicles when entering the roadway.
	<ul> <li>People with limited mobility rely on parking close to their home</li> <li>Consider future disabled parking requirements</li> </ul>	The concept plan has been amended in response to community concerns to significantly reduce proposed parking impacts on Livingstone Road. The proposed bike route improvements will result in a <b>net gain of 7 parking spaces overall</b> .  Where removal of parking is proposed, new opportunities for parking have been identified nearby where feasible.

The parking data in the report is not accurate/is outdated	The initial consideration of route options used available parking occupancy data collected by Council in 2012 and early 2016 to inform understanding of on-street parking demand on Livingstone Road.
	Community feedback has indicated that perceived on-street parking demand is considered to be very high on Livingstone Road. In response, the concept plan has been amended to reduce the impacts to parking on Livingstone Road from 121 spaces removed to 7 spaces removed (and 8 new spaces gained), resulting in a net gain of 1 space on Livingstone Road and 6 additional angled parking spaces on Enfield Street.
Reduce parking loss on Livingstone Road near Robert Street	The revised concept plan has been amended further to reduce parking impacts near the intersection of Livingstone Road and Robert Street.
	The changes provide a shared path for approximately 40 metres north-east of Robert Street, comprising widening of the existing footpath as required to meet shared path standards. This enables three parking spaces on Livingstone Road to be retained.
	In line with the reduced impacts to parking on Livingstone Road, angled parking proposed in the revised concept plan has been deleted.

 Reduce parking impacts on Livingstone Road north of Randall Street
 Specific community comments included as requested:

"We, the residents at 225 Livingstone Road (4 persons with 4 motor vehicles), including the residents at 223 and 227 object once again to the proposed cycle lane and the removal of our right to park our motor vehicles directly outside our homes.

Given that the vast majority of residents along Livingstone Road **DO NOT** want this cycle lane on Livingstone Road is any shape or form, and the fact the Council has twice reopened the proposal due to the fact that the vast majority of residents **DON NOT** want this cycle lane installed, we are very surprised the Council is still pushing ahead with the cycle lane in a slightly amended format. It is hard enough to obtain on-street parking outside or near our homes at the best of times, and also note on the weekends, especially Sunday's during the Greek Church service times, there is NO parking available to residents. Please also note that along Jersey Street and a number of streets off Livingstone Roads, the resident place their rubbish bins on the street outside their homes, to stop other people parking legally in available onstreet parking spots (see yellow lines on the map below where this occurs on a daily basis). What is the Council doing to enforce these residents to not place their rubbish bins on the street outside their homes to stop other resident legally parking on the road, for example, along Jersey Street?

As stated in previous submissions, there is no requirement for a cycle lane along Livingstone Road in any shape or form, as the road is not wide enough (which raises additional concerns if a cycle lane is installed), there will be considerable inconvenience to residents with loss of on-street parking outside their homes, there is no significant cycle presence along Livingstone Road wot warrant a cycle lane and the fact that 62% of residents have objected and are opposed to the installation of the cycle lane (on two occasions)."

Bike route improvements and associated changes to parking on Livingstone Road south of the Bankstown Line rail corridor have been considered as part of the LR18 (Dulwich Hill station to Marrickville station) bike route concept plan, and are discussed in the LR18 report to be presented to Traffic Committee at the same meeting. This includes changes near Randall Street.

Five parking spaces on Livingstone Road between Randall Street and the rail overbridge are proposed to be removed to accommodate a two-way bike path.

To mitigate the impacts of the removal of these parking spaces, the revised concept plan has proposed 6 additional spaces on the northern side of Randall Street to be gained by providing angled parking. These spaces will be located between 20 and 60 metres from the spaces proposed to be removed.

Further community feedback about the changes proposed in the revised concept plan has resulted in further amendments to provide three additional on-street parking spaces on the rail overbridge by relocating the existing 'no stopping' signage'. These additional spaces will be located between 20 and 50 metres from the spaces proposed to be removed.

The above changes will result in 9 new spaces (i.e. a net increase of 4 spaces) being provided in close proximity to the spaces proposed to be removed.

Parking on side streets	<ul> <li>Support efforts to ensure no net loss of parking</li> <li>Support angled parking as it will increase parking spaces on side streets</li> <li>Angled parking will have a negative impact on side street</li> <li>Angled parking will create traffic congestion on side street</li> <li>Angled parking will worsen pedestrian safety on side street</li> <li>The changes will place extra pressure on side streets</li> </ul>	The concept plan has been amended in response to community feedback to reduce proposed angled parking on side streets, in line with reduced impacts to parking on Livingstone Road. 6 additional spaces are proposed on Enfield Street only, down from 146 additional spaces previously proposed on eight side streets.
	Angled parking must be rear to kerb	This will be considered further in the development of detailed designs for the route.
	There is already high demand for parking on Pile Street	Angled parking on Pile Street is to be investigated further by Council as a separate project.
	There is already high demand for parking on George Street	The concept plan has been amended in response to community concerns to significantly reduce proposed parking impacts on Livingstone Road. The proposed bike route improvements will result in a <b>net gain of 7 parking spaces overall</b> and reduce any flow-on impacts to George Street.
	<ul> <li>School buses and other heavy vehicles frequently use Hawkhurst Street</li> <li>Hawkhurst Street is not wide enough for angled parking</li> </ul>	The concept plan has been amended to delete proposed angled parking on Hawkhurst Street in line with reduced parking impacts nearby on Livingstone Road.
	<ul> <li>School buses frequently use Francis St</li> <li>Francis St is not wide enough for angled parking</li> </ul>	The concept plan has been amended to delete proposed angled parking on Francis Street in line with reduced parking impacts nearby on Livingstone Road.
	Street trees will reduce the number of angled parking spaces.	This has been considered in the concept plan and will be reviewed in the development of detailed designs for the route.
	Robert St is not wide enough for angled parking	The concept plan has been amended to delete proposed angled parking on Robert Street in line with reduced parking impacts nearby on Livingstone Road.

Other parking issues	•	Visitors to St Nicholas and St Brigid's churches will have more difficulty finding parking People with limited mobility rely on nearby parking to access church/other locations in the area People accessing Casimir and St Brigid's schools will have more difficulty finding parking Local businesses will be affected if parking on Livingstone Rd is reduced	The concept plan has been amended in response to community concerns to significantly reduce proposed parking impacts on Livingstone Road. The proposed bike route improvements will result in a <b>net gain of 7 parking spaces overall</b> .
	•	Parking impacts at Marrickville West Public School	The proposed bike route does not pass Marrickville West Public School.
	•	Parking near Marrickville Park is important for park users	The concept plan has been amended to significantly reduce proposed parking impacts near Marrickville Park in response to community concerns. One space is proposed to be removed on Livingstone Road north of Pile Street.  Angled parking on Pile Street will be investigated as part of a separate Council project and if implemented will increase the number of spaces nearby.
	•	A bike path will make it difficult for tradespeople and delivery vehicles to access homes	The concept plan has been amended to retain both parking lanes on Livingstone Road and significantly reduce parking impacts along the route.
	•	People accessing child care centres on Livingstone Rd will have more difficulty finding parking	The concept plan has been amended in response to community concerns to significantly reduce proposed parking impacts on Livingstone Road. The proposed bike route improvements will result in a <b>net gain of 7 parking spaces overall</b> .
Pedestrian safety	•	Removal of parking on Livingstone Road will affect the safety of those accessing child care centres or schools Removal of parking on Livingstone Road will affect the safety of residents, particularly young children and those with limited mobility Removal of parking on Livingstone Road will affect the safety of pedestrians accessing churches	The concept plan has been amended in response to community concerns to significantly reduce proposed parking impacts on Livingstone Road between Marrickville Park and the Bankstown Line rail corridor. The proposed bike route improvements will result in a <b>net gain of 7 parking spaces overall</b> .

A bike path on Livingstone Road will be a hazard for pedestrians	A bike path will provide a safe route for bike riders away from pedestrians.  Appropriate bike path markings and signage will be used to increase awareness for bike riders and pedestrians when using/crossing the path.
Bike riders should share footpaths with pedestrians	Widening of the footpath to sufficient width to accommodate pedestrians and bike riders would require extensive removal of street trees along most sections of Livingstone Road and reduce pedestrian amenity on the path.  Shared paths are proposed only where other alternatives are not feasible without significant parking impacts, and where sufficient widening of the path can be achieved without significant impacts to existing street trees.
A shared path on Livingstone Road outside Kidzville child care centre will be unsafe for pedestrians accessing the centre	The revised concept plan has been amended to address further concerns about pedestrian safety raised by Kidzville child care centre, as well as retain existing on-street parking in front of the child care centre. The changes alter the two-way shared path arrangement proposed in the revised concept plan to provide a 60 metre long hybrid section comprising a one-way separated bike path and one-way shared path, from 30 metres north of Marrickville Road to Hastings Lane.
	The one-way bike path will separate northbounf (downhill) bike riders from pedestrians in front of Kidzville. Given frequent turnover of cars in the 15-minute parking zone in front of Kidzville, the one-way bike path will be separated from parked cars by a 1.0 metre median to provide a protected space for loading/unloading of cars.
	Parallel to the one-way bike path, southbound bike riders will travel on a widened shared path. Southbound bike riders have good sightlines to the entrance of Kidzville and lower speeds as they travel uphill, which will reduce the risk of conflict between bikes and pedestrians.

	Improve poucoulain crossing racinates on Envirgence read	widened as part of the route improvements.
	<ul> <li>Shared environment intersections will improve safety for bike riders</li> <li>The proposed intersection treatments will improve pedestrian safety along Livingstone Road</li> <li>Crossing of side streets and driveways will be dangerous for bike riders</li> <li>Improve the proposed shared environment intersections</li> </ul>	Shared environment intersections will improve pedestrian and bike rider safety and amenity by giving right of way to these users. The treatments feature raised thresholds to reduce vehicle speeds; and a distinctive pavement and signage to signify changed conditions and warn motorists of pedestrian and bicycle movements across the side streets.  Appropriate markings and signage will be used to increase awareness for motorists when crossing the shared environment intersections.
Bike route	<ul> <li>There is no demand for a bike path on Livingstone Road</li> <li>A bike path on Livingstone Road would be a waste of money</li> <li>Other bike paths in Sydney are not well used</li> <li>A bike path will make it easier to use a bike for local trips</li> </ul>	A bike path on Livingstone Road would offer a safe, comfortable and convenient north-south link for residents and visitors to local destinations, such as Marrickville Park, the planned Marrickville Library and Community Hub, local schools and local shops as well as to planned connecting bike routes for other local destinations and further afield.  As routes become more connected and continuous, ease of travel by bike will improve and more local trips by bike become possible.  The NSW Government policy <i>Sydney's Cycling Future</i> states that 70% of people in NSW would ride more if bike riding was made safer for them, and that more than half of residents in inner Sydney would ride a bike to work at least once a week if they could use a bike path that is separated from motor vehicles.  This is supported by evidence where other bike paths have been constructed in Sydney. For example, the number of bike riders on Carrington Road increased by nearly 50% in the first year following construction of the separated bike path in 2014. George Street, Redfern has seen the number of bike riders grow 400% since a separated bike path was installed; on Bowden Street Alexandria there has been a 250% growth in the number of bike riders in the last five years.

Three pedestrian refuges on Livingstone Road are proposed to be

Improve pedestrian crossing facilities on Livingstone Road

Crossings

For example:  Council is currently developing plans for a route between Dulwich Hill and Marrickville stations that will connect the Livingstone Road bike path at Randall Street/Jersey Stre local shops and train stations.  In 2016/17, Council will also commence planning of a roubetween Marrickville Park and Petersham Park/Parramat Road, as identified in Council's Bike Plan.	Local residents will be unfairly inconvenienced for a minority of the community	The concept plan has been amended in response to community concerns to significantly reduce proposed parking impacts on Livingstone Road. The proposed bike route improvements will not only offer a safer bike route for local residents but also result in a net gain of 7 parking spaces overall.
Road and between Lewisham and Newtown.  Proposed routes connecting to Marrickville West PS are identified.	<ul> <li>Extend the route north to connect to Addison Road and/or Petersham</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>provide improved links to local destinations including shops, schools, parks and train stations. The Bike Plan identifies a number of routes that will link with the Livingstone Road bike path. For example: <ul> <li>Council is currently developing plans for a route between Dulwich Hill and Marrickville stations that will connect the Livingstone Road bike path at Randall Street/Jersey Street to local shops and train stations.</li> <li>In 2016/17, Council will also commence planning of a route between Marrickville Park and Petersham Park/Parramatta Road, as identified in Council's Bike Plan.</li> <li>Other routes are currently being investigated along Addison</li> </ul> </li></ul>

	<ul> <li>Alternative routes need to be considered</li> <li>Wardell Road is a better route option</li> <li>The bike route can travel along side streets rather than Livingstone Rd</li> <li>Provide a route that better connects bike riders to the city</li> </ul>	Alternative options have been considered.  Wardell Road would offer a circuitous route to Marrickville station and Marrickville south that would not encourage trips to be taken by bike given the detour and time delays involved.  Routes using low-volume side streets nearby would also be circuitous given the irregular and indirect layout of the side streets.  Petersham Road offers a direct north-south link to Marrickville shops, however is too narrow to allow for appropriate separation of bikes from other vehicles to the south of Marrickville Road and on Illawarra Road where traffic volumes are higher and provides a circuitous route to Dulwich Hill.  The Livingstone Road route will ultimately connect with other routes proposed in Council's Bike Plan, including Regional Route 7 to inner Sydney.
	Bike route improvements do not benefit those with limited mobility	Bike route improvements can benefit those who do not ride a bike by encouraging fewer local trips by car overall, thus helping to ease traffic congestion and demand for car parking for those who do need to drive.
	<ul> <li>Consider other options to encourage cycling</li> <li>Reduce speeds/narrow traffic lanes on Livingstone Road</li> </ul>	Safe infrastructure is identified by the NSW Government as one a core element in encouraging bike riding for local trips. Providing safer bike riding infrastructure is also consistent with Council's stated objectives to improve bike rider safety, provide accessible cycleways and promote bike riding.
		Efforts to encourage bike riding will not be as effective without the provision of safe infrastructure where appropriate. Providing separated bike infrastructure on Livingstone Road is consistent with RMS guidelines, given existing traffic volumes.
Bike route design	Include bike parking along the route	This will be considered further in the development of detailed designs for the route.

•	Improve street lighting for the bike path	This will be considered further in the development of detailed designs for the route.
•	The bike path should not be signposted as a 'bike lane'	The concept plan has been amended to remove 'Bike Lane' signposting.
•	The proposed bike path is too narrow	The proposed bike path is consistent with RMS guidelines for two- way bike paths and allows two bike riders to safely pass one another. While a wider bike path would be more attractive for bike riders, it would require the removal of a parking lane and would not have the support of the local community.
•	Improve traffic signal phasing for bicycles	Decisions regarding traffic signal phasing are subject to RMS approval.
		The concept plan has been amended to provide a shared pedestrian and bike crossing at the intersection of Livingstone Road and Marrickville Road.
•	The concept plan does not include provision for bike riders turning off Livingstone Rd	This will be considered further in the development of detailed designs for the route.
•	Ensure the bike path is wide enough to accommodate cargo bikes	The proposed 2.0m wide bike path is wide enough to accommodate standard bicycles and most cargo bikes.
•	Do not support the removal of any street trees	An olive tree may be removed near the corner of Livingstone Road and Robert Street to provide sufficient space for widening of the existing footpath for a shared path. Removal will be subject to further investigation during the development of detailed designs for the route. If removal is required, new street tree plantings will be provided nearby.
•	Consider tree planting and landscaping to improve amenity and environmental sustainability	New tree plantings are proposed on Livingstone Road north of Marrickville Road. Further opportunities for tree planting and landscaping will be considered further in the development of detailed designs for the route.

Traffic impacts	<ul> <li>Livingstone Rd is already congested / New development will worsen congestion</li> <li>A bike path on Livingstone Rd will reduce traffic congestion</li> </ul>	The proposed bike path does not reduce the number of traffic lanes on Livingstone Road.
	<ul> <li>A bike path on Livingstone Road will worsen traffic congestion</li> <li>Removing parking on Livingstone Road will worsen traffic congestion</li> </ul>	A safer bike route along Livingstone Road will encourage some local trips to be taken by bike rather than by car, thus helping to ease traffic congestion.
	The changes at the intersection of Livingstone Rd and Marrickville Rd will delay traffic	The concept plan has been amended to provide a shared pedestrian and bike crossing at the intersection of Livingstone Road and Marrickville Road.
Bike rider safety	Bike riders do not obey road rules	Council and the NSW Government continue to take part in education campaigns for all road users including bike riders.
	<ul> <li>Livingstone Road is presently unsafe for bike riders</li> <li>A bike path will make Livingstone Rd safer for bike riders</li> <li>Two-way bike paths are unsafe for bike riders</li> <li>Bike riders can use the travel lanes</li> <li>Livingstone Road is too busy to accommodate bicycles</li> </ul>	The two-way bike path will improve bike rider safety by separating bike riders from motor vehicle traffic and pedestrians.
	Will reinforce divisions between riders and non-riders	The bike path provides a defined space for bike riders to enable safer journeys and to encourage people of all ages and abilities to ride.
	Bike riding on streets with angled parking will be dangerous	The number of streets proposed to have angled parking has been significantly reduced. Angled parking will reduce vehicle speeds by narrowing the roadway for through traffic, and thus help to improve safety of all road users. Specific treatments to ensure a safe road environment will be considered further in the development of detailed designs for the route.
Encouraging bike riding	<ul> <li>Bike riding is a useful form of exercise</li> <li>Riding a bicycle is good for the environment</li> <li>Bike riders don't pay to use the road</li> </ul>	An Australian Government study in 2013 cited findings that a 20 minute bike ride to work and back benefits the Australian economy by \$14.30, by improving health and reducing traffic congestion and pollution.
		Public roads are for the use of all road users, including bike riders.

Livingstone Road is too busy/too narrow for both bikes and buses	The concept plan proposes a bike path and retains traffic lanes and bus stops for bus operations.
In-lane bus stops will delay traffic	The bus stops on Livingstone Road presently serve 4-5 buses per hour in the morning and evening peak periods, and delays associated with buses stopping in-lane are thus expected to be minimal.
	In-lane bus stops are supported by Sydney Buses as they will improve bus on-time running by preventing delays associated with buses merging back into the traffic lane.
In-lane bus stops will be unsafe for bus users	In-lane bus stops have been installed next to bike paths elsewhere in Sydney with design measures to enhance bus user safety and comfort, such as:
	<ul> <li>marked pedestrian crossings across the bike path,</li> <li>lean rails/barriers to separate the bus stop area from the bike path; and</li> </ul>
	<ul> <li>treatments along the bike path to increase awareness of pedestrians crossing the path</li> </ul>
	Design measures to enhance safety and comfort of the in-lane bus stops will be considered further in the development of detailed designs for the route.
<ul> <li>Concerns about Sydney Buses proposal to remove bus stops near Pile Street</li> <li>Residents with limited mobility rely on the Pile Street bus stop</li> </ul>	Following public exhibition of the draft concept plan, Sydney Buses advised that it is no longer considering removal of the bus stops near Pile Street. This has been shown in the final concept plan.
The 412 bus service may be removed	Sydney Buses has <u>not</u> indicated any changes to the 412 bus service.
<ul> <li>The bike path will affect garbage collection</li> <li>Bins will be a hazard for bikes</li> <li>Garbage trucks will hold up traffic</li> </ul>	Garbage bins will be collected from the verge, as per current practice. Garbage trucks will stop in the traffic lane or parking lane when collecting garbage bins, as per current practice.
	<ul> <li>In-lane bus stops will delay traffic</li> <li>In-lane bus stops will be unsafe for bus users</li> <li>Concerns about Sydney Buses proposal to remove bus stops near Pile Street</li> <li>Residents with limited mobility rely on the Pile Street bus stop</li> <li>The 412 bus service may be removed</li> <li>The bike path will affect garbage collection</li> <li>Bins will be a hazard for bikes</li> </ul>

### RMS

Topic	RMS comments	Council officer response
Configuration	RMS supports in-principle a cross-section comprising 3.2m travel lanes, 2.1m parking lanes, a 2.0m two-way bike path and a 0.2m separating kerb.	This configuration has been incorporated into the concept plan.
Intersection changes	<ul> <li>RMS requires modelling of the intersection with the proposed bike path through the intersection, to ensure there is no reduction in Level of Service at the intersection.</li> <li>The design needs to be tested for truck turning movements.</li> </ul>	pedestrian and bike crossing at the intersection of Livingstone Road and Marrickville Road. Intersection Level of Service is subject to review by RMS.
		No changes to truck turning movements are proposed.

### **Sydney Buses**

Topic	Sydney Buses comments	
Bus stops	Lane width at bus stops needs to be 3.0m	This has been incorporated into the concept plan.
	<ul> <li>The bus stops near Pile Street are proposed to be removed by Transport for NSW</li> <li>The bus stops near Pile Street are to remain</li> </ul>	The revised advice regarding Pile Street bus stops has been incorporated into the concept plan.
	Sydney Buses proposes removing the southbound bus stop north of the intersection of Livingstone Road and Marrickville Road, subject to community consultation by Sydney Buses	This will be considered further in the development of detailed designs for the route once a decision has been reached by Sydney Buses.
	Sydney Buses supports in-lane bus stops on Livingstone Road	This has been incorporated into the concept plan.
	All bus stops along the route should be formalised.	Bus stops along the route that are being adjusted or relocated will be formalised.

# **Sydney Trains**

Topic	Sydney Trains comments	
Bridges over rail lines	<ul> <li>Road Rail Safety Interface Agreements are required before any work can be undertaken on the Livingstone Road bridge over the rail line.</li> </ul>	Council will obtain Road Rail Safety Interface Agreements as required.